

S-3

Modal Questions and Point-of-View Shift in Korean and Japanese

Yukinori Takubo and Masahiro Yamada

National Institute for Japanese Language and Linguistics

1.1. Japanese modal *hazu* normally cannot appear in questions

- (1) a. Zimen-ga nureteiru hazu-da.
ground-NOM be.wet hazu-COP
“The ground must be wet.”
- b. Yamada-wa inai hazu-da.
Yamada-TOP be.absent hazu-COP
“Yamada must be absent.”
- (2) a. ??Zimen-ga nureteiru hazu-desu-ka?
ground-NOM be.wet hazu-COP-Q
“The ground must be wet.”
- b. ??Yamada-wa inai hazu-desu-ka?
Yamada-TOP be.absent hazu-COP-Q
“Yamada must be absent.”

Point of view shift in questions

- (3) a. He will be admitted to Rits. (**I think** he will be...’)
- b. Will he be admitted to Rits? (‘Do you think he will be...’)

Point of view shift in *will*

Affirmative sentence: compatible with the knowledge of **the speaker**

Interrogative sentence: compatible with the knowledge of **the hearer**

The contrast (1)-(2) appeared to be accounted for in terms of the point of view shift. Takubo and Kim (2009) attempted to explain the contrast in (1)-(2) in terms of the point of view shift or the lack thereof, namely, by stipulating that epistemic necessity modals do not allow deictic shift. Below we will take a close look at *hazu* and give a principled account for their stipulation based on the lexical semantics of *hazu*.

1.2. “*q-hazu*” signals that *q* is a logical consequence of some sort

- | | |
|---|--|
| “the ground is wet- <i>hazu</i> ” (=1a) | “Yamada is absent- <i>hazu</i> ” (=1b)) |
| if it rains, the ground is wet | if x’s travel document has been submitted, x is absent |
| <u>it rained</u> | <u>Yamada’s travel document has been submitted</u> |
| the ground is wet | Yamada is absent |

“q-hazu” presupposes some set of propositions *P* that make *q* true.

In case of Modus Ponens, if *p, q* [if *p, q*] and [*p*] are presupposed *P*.

$$\frac{p}{q}$$

1.3. “q-hazu?” is ruled out because of contradiction

“q-hazu?” still presupposes a set of propositions <i>P</i> that make <i>q</i> true	... hazu
“q-hazu?” ~ “ <i>q</i> or $\neg q$, which one is it?”	... yes/no-Q
$\neg q$ contradicts with what <i>P</i> entails, i.e. <i>q</i>	... contradiction

Therefore: “q-hazu?” is not a legitimate question

2.1. *noda* saves “q-hazu?”

(3) a. ??Zimen-ga nureteiru hazu-desu-ka?
 ground-NOM be.wet hazu-COP-Q
 “The ground must be wet.”

b. ??Yamada-wa inai hazu-desu-ka?
 Yamada-TOP be.absent hazu-COP-Q
 “Yamada must be absent.”

(=(2))

(4) a. Zimen-ga nureteiru hazu-**nano**-desu-ka?
 ground-NOM be.wet hazu-**noda**-COP-Q
 “The ground must be wet.”

b. Yamada-wa inai hazu-**nano**-desu-ka?
 Yamada-TOP be.absent hazu-**noda**-COP-Q
 “Yamada must be absent.”

2.2. *noda* triggers abduction

Suppose we all know: if it rains, then the ground is wet
 premise consequence

Deduction | By observing the premise(s), you draw the consequence.

if it rains, the ground is wet	... we all know	
<u>it rained</u>	... premise observed	
the ground is wet	... consequence drawn	→ “the ground is wet-hazu”

Abduction | By observing the consequence, you hypothesize (one of) the premise(s).

if it rains, the ground is wet	... we all know	
<u>the ground is wet</u>	... consequence observed	
it rained	... premise drawn	→ “it rained-noda”

2.3. “q-hazu-noda?” asks (one of) the premise(s), therefore it’s ok

By adding *noda* to “q-hazu?”, you can ask what *q* presupposes.

- (5) a. Zimen-ga nureteiru hazu-**nano**-desu-ka? (Volitional)
 ground-NOM wet hazu-**noda**-COP-Q
 “The ground must be wet.” (=4a)
 ~“(In this country, is it true that if it rains) the ground is wet?”

if it rains, the ground is wet ← asking this part
it rained
 the ground is wet

- b. Yamada-wa inai hazu-**nano**-desu-ka? (Epistemic)
 Yamada-TOP absent hazu-**noda**-COP-Q
 “Yamada must be absent.” (=4b)
 ~“(Is it true that Yamada’s travel document has been submitted and thus) he is absent?”

if x’s travel document has been submitted, x is absent
Yamada’s travel document has been submitted ← asking this part
 Yamada is absent

noda saves “q-hazu?” by asking *q-hazu*’s premise(s) P;

“q-hazu-noda?” still presupposes a set of propositions P that make *q* true ... *hazu*

“q-hazu?” ~ “*q* or ¬*q*, which one is it?” ... yes/no-Q

¬*q* contradicts with what P entails, i.e. *q* ... contradict.

But: “q-hazu-noda?” asks P as well ~ “*p* or ¬*p* (*p*∈P), which one is it?” ... *noda*

Therefore: “q-hazu-noda?” is a legitimate question

4. Korean “q-l kes-i-” patterns with “q-hazu”

“q-l kes-i-” when used as epistemic modal cannot be used as true questions.

- (6) a. Nayil na-nun Seoul-ey ka-l **kes-i**-pni-ta. (Volitional)
 tomorrow I-TOP Seoul-to go-l **kes-i**-HON-IND
 “I will go to Seoul tomorrow.”
 b. Nayil-un pi-ka o-l **kes-i**-pni-ta. (Epistemic)
 tomorrow-TOP rain-NOM come-l **kes-i**-HON-IND
 “(I think) it will rain tomorrow.”
- (7) a. Nayil tangsin-un o-l **kes-i**-pni-kka? (Volitional)
 tomorrow you-TOP come-l **kes-i**-HON-Q
 “Are you coming tomorrow?”
 b. * Nayil-un pi-ka o-l kes-i-pni-ta. (Epistemic)
 tomorrow-TOP rain-NOM come-l kes-i-HON-IND
 “(Do you think) it will rain tomorrow?”

“q-l *kes-i-*” expresses ‘logical consequences’ just like “q-*hazu*” and presupposes that there are premises from which *q* can be deduced.

- (8) Pi-ga o-l **kes-i**-pni-ta
rain-NOM come-1 **kes-i**-HON-IND
“It will rain.”

if there are halos around the moon, it will rain
there are halos around the moon
it will rain

“q-l *kes-i-*” in this use cannot be questioned because it is interpreted that you are questioning what you just deduced, i.e. you are denying your presuppositions.

- (9)* Pi-ka o-l kes-i-pni-kka?
rain-NOM come-1 kes-i-HON-IND
“(Do you think) it will rain?”

Notice that “q-l *kes-i-*” cannot be made into a meta-question, i.e. a question about the premises. To ask a question about the premises in Japanese *noda* is used to expand the scope to include premises. This is impossible in Korean because of the morphological make-up of *-l kes-i-*. Meta-questions in Korean can be formed by attaching *-nun kes-i-* for present and *-n kes-i-* for past eventualities.

- (10) a. Pi-ka o-**nun** **kes-i**-pni-kka?
rain-NOM come-**PRES.ADNOM** **kes-i**-HON-Q
“You have an umbrella with you (because it will rain)?”
b. Pi-ka o-**n** **kes-i**-pni-kka?
rain-NOM come-**PAST.ADNOM** **kes-i**-HON-Q
“You are all wet (because it rained)?”

Morphologically *-l kes-i-* forms a paradigm with these meta-markers even though it is fully grammaticalized to become a modal auxiliary. So it cannot be followed by these meta-markers. Notice that for copula *-i* the present adnominal form is *-n* and past adnominal form is *-den*.

- (11) a. * Pi-ka o-l **kes-i-n** **kes-i**-pni-kka?
rain-NOM come-1 **kes-i-PRES.ADNOM** **kes-i**-Q
Int. “Is it because it will rain(, you have an umbrella with you)?”
b. * Pi-ka o-l **kes-i-den** **kes-i**-pni-kka?
rain-NOM come-1 **kes-i-PAST.ADNOM** **kes-i**-HON-Q
Int. “Is it because it rained(,you are all wet)?”

There are some marginal differences between Korean *-l kes-i-* and Japanese *hazu*, such that the former can marginally be used to ask a deity or scientists, who can control rain-fall. *Hazu* cannot be used in such cases.

References

- Karttunen, Lauri. 1979. Syntax and semantics of questions. *Linguistics and Philosophy* 1, 3-44.
- Groenendijk, Jeroen and Martin Stokhoff. 1984. *Studies on the semantics of questions and the pragmatics of answers*. PhD thesis, University of Amsterdam.
- Hamblin, Charles. 1973. Questions in Montague English. *Foundation of Language* 10. Reprinted in: B. Partee (ed.) 1976. *Montague Grammar*. New York, Academic Press.
- Kuno, Susumu. 1973. *Structures of Japanese*. MIT Press
- Takubo, Yukinori. 2009. Conditional modality: Two types of modal auxiliaries in Japanese. Pizziconi, B. and M. Kizu (eds.) *Japanese Modality: Exploring its Scope and Interpretation*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Takubo, Yukinori and Summi Kim. 2009. Kankokugo-to nihongo-no modaritii-hyoogen-no taishoo (A comparative study of the modality expressions in Japanese and Korean) *Chosen-hantoo-no kotoba-to shakai* (The Languages and the Society of Korean Peninsula): 298-312. Akashi-shoten